

Tax Revenue and Economic Growth in Nigeria

ABSTRACT

The main objective of this study is to examine the effect of tax revenue on economic growth in Nigeria. This study covers a period of 27 years (1995-2022). The reason for choosing this period is that it depicted by the fact that it fall within timeline in which VAT one of components indirect was introduced by the Nigerian government. Pair Granger causality testing was employed to ascertain the relationship between dependent and independent variables. The results showed that first; there is a no significant relationship between CIT and economic growth in Nigeria. The results revealed that there is a positive relationship between VAT and economic growth in both long run and short run. Finally, the Granger causality test results, showed that there is no significant relationship between custom duty and economic growth in Nigeria. The study recommended that policy makers should concentration effort on long run policies that will stimulate generation of indirect taxes in the long-run

Keywords: Value added Tax, company income tax, Economic growth

Comment [M1]: Rephrase this statement. There are some missing statement

Comment [M2]: remove

Comment [M3]: Write in full. It has not been written in full before. It is being mentioned for the first time here Show the statistical result for VAT and other variables

Comment [M4]: Write in full. It is being mentioned for the first time here.

Comment [M5]: concentrate

Comment [M6]: This recommendation does not align with the recommendation provided in the paper.

Comment [M7]: Arrange them alphabetically. Increase the the number to 5 keywords

INTRODUCTION

The economic growth of a nation is reliant on an unwavering means of income. After the Great Depression of the 1930s, Governments world over initiated the adoption of stabilization policies that encompass miscellaneous macroeconomic policies in order to avert ugly incidence that occurred during the great depression. These were fiscal policies which require; government's run the economy via vicissitudes in revenue and expending capacity to realize wanted macroeconomic goals, prominent of these goals is economic advancement, (Oriavwote&Eshenake, 2015)

Modern-day tax administrators are after numerous strategic goals and notable amongst these set objectives is generation of revenues for economic sustainability. Taxation is aimed at raising the required moneys for executing capital project, for equitable redistribution of income, to engender economy stability, to overcome externalities, to influence the allotment of resources, while in the same vein it engender economic advancement. A good tax system is intended to drive economic growth and engender economic advancement. An effective tax system plays a vital role in achievement of economic growth and fiscal amalgamation.

Economic theory opines that taxes produces alterations and by extension influences the economy negatively. Some scholars suggest that corporate and personal income taxes are the greatly retards the growth of an economy, whereas consumption, environment and property taxes are have injurious effect on the economy (OECD, 2008). The it duty bound of government over world particularly specialized market to collect tax revenue from their citizen to provide social amenities. The quest to realize these duties principally depends on the aggregate volume tax revenue collected by the government via numerous including taxes. Taxes are of the one of the primogenital means through which the funds for provision indispensable amenities for the

Comment [M8]: remove

Comment [M9]: Correct the statement

Comment [M10]: Correct this

Comment [M11]: Look into this

Comment [M12]: s

Comment [M13]: Remove s

Comment [M14]: Remove s

Comment [M15]: remove

Comment [M16]: Remove s

Comment [M17]: remove

Comment [M18]: No clarity. Rephrase the statement

Comment [M19]: Add s

Comment [M20]: of

Comment [M21]: Something is missing here

Comment [M22]: remove

Comment [M23]: Correct this

citizens of a nations (Abiola&Asiweh, 2012). The principal purpose of a tax system is to generate adequate revenue to fund crucial capital project like road, bridges etc.. Tax remains one of the most veritable tools used for the enhancement of the public sector performance and the servicing of public debt (Okoye &Ezejiofor, 2014). A good tax system avails itself as a veritable tool that help in mobilizing a country's internal resources and it gives itself to create an ecosystem that is favorable for the promoting economic advancement (Ayuba, 2014).

Comment [M24]: Not clear. The author should revisit this

Comment [M25]: Replace with another capital project

Comment [M26]: Add s

Comment [M27]: remove

Over the years, the conventional tasks of governments have been maintenance of law and order and provision of social amenities by undertaking some investments and expenditure. Through these means, the government directly or indirectly improves the productivity of the private sector by efficient and effective allocation of scarce resources. It is worthy of note that these roles have moved in contemporary times to include provision employment, price level stability, advancement of economic and expansion, preservation of equipoise of payment evenness and advancement of equitable revenue and fund sharing. In recognition of these functions, most governments across the globe attach great importance to the quality and performance of their economy and to achieve these objectives governments usually embark on fiscal and financial policy apparatuses such as taxes and disbursements to boost economic activities and stimulus the of the economic growth.

Comment [M28]: of

Comment [M29]: Rephrase this for clarity

Comment [M30]: Rephrase this

Comment [M31]: economic

The economy performance of any government from the stand point of the public sector is partly proxy by the volume and quality of infrastructure amenities accessible to its populace. The capacity of the government of a nation to provide social amenities is a function of the revenue at the disposal of that government. Most developing nations of the world have multiple strings of

incomes hence the delivery of social amenities is high. On the contrary most developing nation of the world are mono economic, they depend largely on income generated from exports of natural resources such as oil and agricultural produces

Comment [M32]: Add s

Comment [M33]: Product economy

Comment [M34]: singular

Notwithstanding the numerous theoretical and empirical researches, as well as policy and policy polemics, the impact of taxation on government capital expenditure in developing countries like Nigeria is still very much inconclusive. Prior studies suggests that tax revenue is negatively related with tax rate and by extension implies that high tax rates impedes government capital expenditure. Nantob (2014) argues that higher tax rates may create more distortion in revenue generation because tax evasion and tax avoidance will high. The author further report that lower rates will generate productive income. Some extant literature suggest that there is indirect and inverse relationship between tax burden and capital expenditure.

Comment [M35]: Remove s

Comment [M36]: Remove s

Comment [M37]: be

Comment [M38]: reported

The relationship between tax burden and provision of social amenities has led to scholarly discuss among policy makers in past decades and the extant literature has divulged that the allotment of tax income in an economy is influenced by government policies which often engender behavioural distortions of economic players.. Investigating the effects of tax revenue on provision of social amenities can approach from three stand points, namely exogenous, endogenous and incidence schools of thought. The exogenous school focused on the exogenous growth model as pioneered by Solow (1956) postulates that tax policy has a role to play in attaining long-term economic growth, on the premise that labour and technological progress (which is key factors responsible for economic expansion) are determined outside the model. At the other extreme is the endogenous school of thought focused on the endogenous growth models which according to Lucas (1988), King and Rebelo (1990) and Barro (1990) postulates that tax policy have a relationship with capital expenditure and welfare over time, and economic

Comment [M39]: discourse

Comment [M40]: Be approached

Comment [M41]: Who postulated

Comment [M42]: d

Comment [M43]: has

expansion is determined within the model. The incidence school of thought argues that there is a causality between tax burden (tax) and revenue generation. The proponents of this school of thought contend that the direction of the relationship rides on the wings of macroeconomic factors

This study is built on the perspective of the incidence school of thought and draws it strength from their arguments. Very few prior studies looked at the causation of between tax and capital expenditure holistically and this creates the gap in knowledge that this study intend to fill. The objective this study is to ascertain the causality between tax revenues and capital expenditure in Nigeria.

Comment [M44]: remove

Comment [M45]: Add s

Comment [M46]: of

Comment [M47]: remove

Indirect taxes are seen as the utmost kind of taxation in many specialized markets but in Nigeria tax payers have the doubt around the feasibility of taxes that fall within this preview. Some persons suggest that it is governments' way of bellicoselyrobing people of hard earn money because there is no corresponding infrastructural development. The reason for this is because the funds generated from indirect taxes like VAT and other are not used effectively and efficiently. Nevertheless the many hypothetical and empirical researches on taxation and economic growth in emerging markets like Nigeria is still very much inadequate. Theoretical literature infers that the taxes has adverse effect on the economic and by extension implies that high tax rates impede economic growth. Nantob (2014) argues that higher tax rates may create more distortion in economic activities hence it will hamper economic growth. The author further report that lower rates will generate productive income. Some extant literature suggest that there is indirect and inverse relationships between tax burden and growth rates. Thus, future economic output may be

Comment [M48]: purview

Comment [M49]: Not clear

Comment [M50]: earned

Comment [M51]: State in full

Comment [M52]: There are

Comment [M53]: are

Comment [M54]: have

Comment [M55]: economy

Comment [M56]: reported

higher than the optimal tax rate and thus future tax revenues would be higher at a lower tax rate (Nantob, 2014).

The exogenous school focused on the exogenous growth model as pioneered by Solow (1956) postulates that tax policy has a role to play in attaining long-term economic growth, on the premise that labour and technological progress (which is key factors responsible for economic expansion) are determined outside the model. At the other extreme is the endogenous school of thought focused on the endogenous growth models which according to Lucas (1988), King and Rebelo (1990) and Barro (1990) postulate that tax policy have a relationship with economic growth and welfare over time, and economic expansion is determined within the model. The incidence school of thought argues that there is a causality between tax burden (indirect tax) and economic. The proponents of this school of thought argue that the direction of the relationship riders on wings of macroeconomic factors

Comment [M57]: has

Comment [M58]: economy

Comment [M59]: rides

This study is built on the perspective of the incidence school of thought and draws it strength from their arguments. Very few prior studies looked at the causation of between indirect tax holistically and economic and this creates the gap in knowledge that this study intend to fill. The causality between indirect tax and economic growth in developing countries revealed in prior unclear and this virtually initiated an impetus for carrying out this study.

Comment [M60]: its

Comment [M61]: remove

Comment [M62]: growth

Comment [M63]: s

Comment [M64]: Not complete

Theoretical Framework

This work is anchored on the theory stated below

2.3.2 Benefits Theory

The benefit theory was initially developed by Wicksell (1896) and Lindahl (1919). The theory had being used to elucidate issues such as tax progressivity, business taxes, and taxes on property or wealth. The benefits theory of taxation strengthens by Cooper (1994) postulated that government should impose tax on a person founded on the benefits the persons attained from the services (social goods) performed by the government. This theory presumed that there is an emblematic association amid the taxpayers and the government. This theory tends to explain the association between tax and economic growth. This theory argues the tax proceeds collected by the government ought be reinvested into the sustainability of the nation's advancement via the provision of social amenities, enforcement of law and order. Lastly, converting to the feasible tax system that amalgamates both goods tax and individual income tax, concurrently resulting in an optimum consequence for society, have been evaluated by numerous. Specifically, they founded their study on the analysis of Mirrlees (1971) with regard optimal income taxation by accumulation conceivable influence of commodity taxation on the economy. To be more exact, the study is founded on utility intensification glitch bearing in mind both consumption of goods and labor supply subject to income restraint, price of numerous kinds of goods as well as capability of labor force. In that manner having leisureliness also considered as being one of the products with its price being equivalent to hourly wage of the labor, since one needs to forgo one hour salary in order to receive additional hour of relaxation time. Atkinson and Stiglitz (1976) argue that product taxes can be equivalent to zilch and employment of only income tax is sufficient to meet welfare to get the most out of its set goal. Precisely, the outcomes are

Comment [M65]: No numbering from the beginning

Comment [M66]: been

Comment [M67]: to

grounded on the taxation of inborn capability of persons, however in the condition of separation, immaterial influence of product taxation on consumers buying pattern is discovered. Otherwise, it also can be implicit stated that a certain cluster of products that are being chosen over other categories of products by consumers, who are supplying more working hours, needs to pay higher tax. This is primarily because the positive association between marginal rate of replacement of a commodity and labor because labor supply upsurges, other being equivalent. Moreover, Mirrlees (1976) emphasize that the certain kind of goods that are being more preferred by those workers with highest ability should be taxes the most with the highest rates. Alternatively, Christiansen (1984) made slightly different approach with respect to combined optimal taxation structure by considering income taxation and commodity taxation jointly. in particular, he elucidate that it should be structured in two stages. First stage is the economy with the most advantageous income taxation system devoid of any commodity taxes. The second stage, involves product taxation and ascertain its influence on the wellbeing of households by preserving the tax revenue continuous.

Comment [M68]: This should be reviewed for grammatical errors before publication for the Journal's integrity.

Comment [Ma69]: No empirical review

METHODOLOGY

Area of Study

This study covers the impact of indirect tax on economic growth economic growth. The study focuses on twenty seven (27). In order to obtain a robust analysis, the researcher used the macroeconomic data.

Comment [M70]: The topic should reflect this

Comment [M71]: Not complete

This research, in view of its nature made use of secondary data. The data were sourced from the publications of Federal Inland Revenue Service, Central Bank of Nigeria (CBN) Statistical Bulletin and the publications of the National Bureau of Statistics (NBS) for the study span

through a period nineteen, 1994-2019. VECM is employed to analyse data extracted from the field.

Comment [M72]: This is different from what was stated in the abstract. The abstract captured 1995-2022 and a period of 27 years. Reconcile the two figures

3.5 Model Specification

Comment [M73]: The numbering is not consistent

Based on the conjectural framework and the objective of the study, the econometric model is adapted from the works of Aderetiet *al.* (2011) and Yadirichukwu and Ebiringa (2012) and is specified as follows:

This study will adopt Regression Model to examine the effect of tax revenue on economic growth in Nigeria. The model structure is as follows;

Comment [M74]: This was not mentioned in the abstract

$$GDP = F(VAT, CIT, CED) \dots\dots\dots (3.1)$$

Comment [M75]: f

$$GDP = \beta_0 + \beta_1 CIT_{it} + \beta_2 VAT_{it} + \beta_3 CED_{it} + \mu_0 \dots\dots\dots (3.2)$$

Where:

- GDP_{it} = Gross Domestic Product
- β₀_{it} = Constant
- β₁₋₃ = Co- efficient independent variables
- CIT = Company Income Tax
- VAT = Value Added Tax
- CED = Customs and Excise duties
- μ₀ = Error term
- i = Number of time
- t = Period of time

3.8.3 Data Analysis Technique

Accordingly, Vector Error Correction Model (VECM) is suitable to estimate the effect of determinant variables on Economic growth. Thus, the equations below represent Error Correction Model. Besides, the purpose of ECM model is to indicate the speed of adjustment from the short run equilibrium to the long run equilibrium state.

Comment [M76]: Granger causality was mentioned in the abstract

Model

$$\Delta GDP_t = \sum_{k-i}^m \theta_{1.1,j,k} \Delta GDP_{t-k} + \sum_{k-i}^m \theta_{1.2,j,k} \Delta VAT_{t-k} + \sum_{k-i}^m \theta_{1.3,j,k} \Delta CED_{t-k} + \sum_{k-i}^m \theta_{1.4,j,k} \Delta CIT_{t-k} + U_{it}, \dots \dots \dots (1)$$

$$\Delta VAT_{it} = \sum_{k-i}^m \theta_{2.1,j,k} \Delta GDP_{t-k} + \sum_{k-i}^m \theta_{2.2,j,k} \Delta CED_{t-k} + \sum_{k-i}^m \theta_{2.3,j,k} \Delta VAT_{t-k} + U_{it}, \dots \dots \dots (12)$$

$$\Delta CED_{it} = \sum_{k-i}^m \theta_{3.1,j,k} \Delta GDP_{t-k} + \sum_{k-i}^m \theta_{3.2,j,k} \Delta VAT_{t-k} + \sum_{k-i}^m \theta_{3.3,j,k} \Delta CED_{t-k} + \sum_{k-i}^m \theta_{3.4,j,k} \Delta CIT_{t-k}$$

$$\Delta CIT_{it} = \sum_{k-i}^m \theta_{4.1,j,k} \Delta GDP_{t-k} + \sum_{k-i}^m \theta_{4.2,j,k} \Delta VAT_{t-k} + \sum_{k-i}^m \theta_{4.3,j,k} \Delta CED_{t-k} + \sum_{k-i}^m \theta_{4.4,j,k} \Delta CIT_{t-k}$$

DATA PRESENTATION AND ANALYSIS

4.3 Inferential Statistics

Comment [M77]: Numbering is not consistent

4.3.1 Panel unit root test results

Unit root test null hypothesis assumption is on the premise that is all sequence are not static, while the alternative hypothesis presumes that some of the sequence are static.

Comment [M78]: Not clear

Table 1. The unit root test for the variables at 5% sig level with no trend.

Variable	ADF value (I)	PP value (I)	ADF value (0)	PP value (0)

GDP	-4.514 (2.925)*	-4.622 (-2.926)*	-0.854 (-2.925)	-0.540(2.925)
CIT	-6.261 (2.947)*	-17.63(-2.925)*	-10.439(-2.941)*	-5.953 (2.925)*
CED	-6.331 (2.925)*	-22.12(-2.925)*	-8.113 (2.928)*	-4.385 (-2.925)*
VAT	-6.111 (2.925)*	-20.12(-2.911)*	-6.113 (2.928)*	-7.382 (-2.925)*
The F unit root test for the variables at 5% sig level at intercept.				

Source: Researcher's computation

Significance * @5%

From Table 1, time series of GDP, CIT, CED and VAT are static at first variance as portrayed by the absolute values of ADF and PP larger than critical values the 5% ADF critical values signifying that the variables are joined of order one. In additional, to affirm the stationary status of the variables ADF and PP test were performed with trend. The results for ADF and PP confirmed that GDP, CIT,CED and VAT remained static at first difference since the real values of ADF and PP exceed the correspondence critical values. The Unit test reveals that there is a combination of I(I) and I(0) of the supplementary regressors, therefore the Auto Regressive Distributive Lag (ARDL) testing could be continued.

Comment [M79]: Not clear

Comment [M80]: addition

Comment [M81]: corresponding

4.3.2 Co-integration

When evaluating variable for co-integration, the VAR model with dual lags, as recommended by AIC and HQIC is considered. The work employed a Panatela principle in order to fix the suitable limitations in the model. The study start by approximating dualistic models. For these models we go from the utmost limiting factor, which includes delimiting constant to the minimum limiting factor which comprises a delimiting trend in the model. Trace statistics and critical value are placed side by side until null hypothesis is not retained. The outcomes of the estimating model are displayed in Table 2.

Comment [M82]: Write in full

Comment [M83]: ed

Table 2 Vector Estimation Correction Model

ECM					
Independe	Dependent	Coefficient	Standard Error	T-Stat.	R-square

nt variable	Variables				
CIT	RGDP	-0.200795	0.00021	-13.2219	0.7954
CED		-0.050365	0.00086	-6.24074	0.6594
VAT		0.001815	0.00054	3.38482	0.8593
Long run					
CIT		-0.000264	0.00022	-1.19506	
CED		0.001432	0.00080	1.78713	
VAT		0.020407	0.0006	3.99987	
Short run					
Estimate					
CIT	RGDP	-0.000416	0.00024	-3.75464	
CED		-0.000763	0.00096	-3.79847	
VAT		0.001286	0.00053	3.44983	

Comment [M84]: RGDP

Source: Author's computation

VECM result reveals that CIT has no significant impact on RGDP in long run at both 5% as depicted by $t = -1.195$ but has significant positive impact in the long run as depicted by $t = 3.755$. The negative sign of EMC (eq) ($t = -13.221$) connotes that CIT has no significant relationship with RGDP in the long run. The result also shows that CIT can only explain 79.5% of RGDP while about 21% is unaccounted for.

Comment [M85]: Remove s

Comment [M86]: 20.5%

The result further reveals that CED has negative impact on RGDP in the short run at 5% as depicted by $t = -3.798$ but has no significant in the long run as depicted by $t = 1.798$. The negative sign of EMC ($p = -6.240$) connotes that it is not probable for CED to influence RGDP in the foreseeable future. The result also shows that CED can only explain 65% of RGDP while 35% is accounted. The result shows that 5% rise in FDI will to lead to decrease in RGDP by 0.001 units in the short run.

Comment [M87]: ed

Comment [M88]: impact

Comment [M89]: Remove s

Comment [M90]: remove

Comment [M91]: The interpretation is not correct. The author should review result

Finally, the result reveals that VAT has significant impact on RGDP in both long as and short run by $t = 3.99$ and $t = 3.44$ respectively. The positive of EMC (Eq) ($t = 3.38$) connotes that it is likely for VAT to influence RGDP in the foreseeable future. The result also shows that CED can

Comment [M92]: This paragraph is for VAT and not CED

only explain 85% of RGDP while 25% is unaccounted. The result shows that 5% rise in FDI will to lead to about 0.0204 units rise in change in RGDP.

Comment [M93]: The interpretation is not correct

5.2 Conclusion

Comment [M94]: The numbering is not correct
This should be Conclusion and Recommendation

The principal duty of every responsible nation is the delivery of sufficient public goods and services that enhance the quality of life of citizens. The realization of these duties depends on the quantum of income gutted by the government via a variety of means. Taxation is among the feasible channels of generating . When taxes are competently and effectively collected, there will be an upsurge government's earnings and citizens on the other hand will anticipate usage of such income to provide social facilities that engender the quality of life of citizens. However, untrained tax personnel and deceptive activities of tax personnel project immense challenges to revenue generation.

Comment [M95]: received

Comment [M96]: revenue generation

Comment [M97]: pose

In acknowledgement of government's functions with respect to providing of welfare, a lot nations world over attribute prodigious significance of tax to the fiscal policy of government. To this end, this study is targeted at finding out the causation among economic growth and tax revenue. This study adopted ADF and Philips-Perron (PP) unit root test, panel Johansen cointegration test, VAR model, auto regression estimate, impulse response function and pairwise granger. Stability tests were also performed to ascertain the stability of the variable. The outcome the study divulged that first, that there is a no emblematic association between CIT and economic growth in Nigeria. This connotes that the Nigerian government is yet to explore this channel of revenue.

Comment [M98]: provision

Comment [M99]: many

Second, the outcomes of the study revealed that there is a affirmative association between VAT and economic growth in both elongated and immediate run. This connotes that VAT has become one of the foremost channels of taxes in Nigeria.

Based on the result the study recommends, government should close every leakage that may led to drainage of taxes

Comment [M100]: lead

REFERENCE

Abiola, J., & Asiweh, M. (2012). Impact of tax administration on government revenue in a developing economy- a case study of Nigeria. *International Journal of Business and Social Science*. 3(8), 99-113

Afubero, D., & Okoye, E. (2014). The impact of taxation on revenue generation in Nigeria. A study of Federal Capital Territory and selected states. *International Journal of Public Administration and Management Research*. 2(2), 22-47.

Comment [Ma101]: Not cited

Angelopoulos, K, Economides, G and Kammas P (2006). Tax-Spending Policies and Economic Growth: Theoretical Predictions and Evidence from the OECD. *European Journal of Political Economics*. 23 (3), 1615-1660

Comment [Ma102]: Not cited

Anojan (2019) Tax Revenue, Total Expense, Gross Domestic Production and Budget Deficit: A Study in Sri Lanka, *Accounting and Finance Research* 7(4)1- 20

Comment [Ma103]: Not cited

Anyanduba, J.O. (1999). *Companies' income taxation in Nigeria*. Benin- City: United City Press.

Comment [Ma104]: Not cited

Anyanwu A.O, Oyefesu H.O, Aikhenan F and Dimowo A (1997). The structure of the Nigeria's economy. Joane Educational Publishers Ltd, Onitsha

Comment [Ma105]: Not cited

Appah, E., & Ebiringa, O.T. (2012). Petroleum profit tax and economic growth in Nigeria. *International Journal of Management Sciences and Business Research*. 1(9), 12-22.

Comment [Ma106]: Not cited

Ayodele, O. (2006). Tax policy reform in West Africa: A case study of Nigeria. *Journal of Accounting, Auditing and Finance*, 17(29), 26-38

Comment [Ma107]: Not cited

Ayuba, A.J. (2014). Impact of non-oil revenue on economic growth: the Nigerian perspective. *International Journal of Finance and Accounting*. 3(5), 303-309.

- Azubike, J. U. (2009). Challenges of tax authorities, tax payers in the management of tax reform processes. *The Nigerian Accountants*, 42(2), 36-42 Comment [Ma108]: Not cited
- Bakare, A.S. (2013). Value added tax and output growth in Nigeria. Proceeding of 8th annual London business research conference imperial college, London, UK Comment [Ma109]: Not cited
- Barro, R., (1990). Economic Growth in a Cross-Section of Countries, *Quarterly Journal of Economics*, 106,(2), 407-443.
- Benos, N. (2009). —Fiscal Policy and Economic Growth: Empirical Evidence from EU Countries, University of Cyprus Department of Economics Working Paper 2009, 1-48. Comment [Ma110]: Not cited
- Dwivedi, D. N. (2004). *Management economics* (6th ed.). London: Matins Press Inc Comment [Ma111]: Not cited
- Fasoranti, M.M. (2013). Tax productivity and economic growth. *Journal of Business and Economics*. 1(1), 1-10 Comment [Ma112]: Not cited
- Ebiringa, O.T., & Emeh, Y. (2012). Analysis of tax formation and impact on economic growth in Nigeria. *International Journal of Accounting and Financial Reporting*. 2(2), 367-385
- Edame, G.E., & Okoi, W.W. (2014). The impact of taxation on investment and economic development in Nigeria. *Academic Journal of Interdisciplinary Studies*. 3(4). 209-218 Comment [Ma113]: Not cited
- Ehigiamusoe K (2013) The Nexus between tax structure and economic growth in Nigeria: A Prognosis *Journal of Economic and Social Studies* Comment [Ma114]: Not cited
- Engen, E and Skinner J, (1992). Fiscal policy and economic growth. NBER Working Paper 4223 Comment [Ma115]: Not cited
- Gacanja W (2012) —Tax revenue and economic growth; An empirical case study of Kenya Unpublished M.A. Thesis University of Nairobi. Kenya Comment [Ma116]: Not cited
- Greenidge, K., & Drakes, L. (2009). Tax policy and macroeconomic activity in Barbados. <http://www.centralbank.org.bb> Comment [Ma117]: Not cited
- Gustavo, C.B., Vazquez M.J and Vulovic V (2013) Growth in Latin America IDB (Inter-American Development Bank). Working paper series No. IDB-WP-431, Washington, DC. Comment [Ma118]: Not cited
- Ibadin, P.O., & Eiya, O. (2013). Tax evasion and avoidance behaviour of the self-employed Nigerians. *European Journal of Business and Management*. 5(6), 1-16. Comment [Ma119]: Not cited
- Ilaboya, O. J, Mgame C.O. Indirect Tax and Economic Growth. *Research Journal of Finance and Accounting*, Vol 3, No.11, 70-81. Comment [Ma120]: Not cited
- Izedonmi, F.I.O., & Okunbor, J.A. (2014). The roles of value added tax in the economic growth of Nigeria. *British Journal of Economics, Management & Trade*. 4(12). 1999-2007. Comment [Ma121]: Not cited

Jibrin, S.M., Blessing, S.E., & Ifurueze, M.S.K. (2012). Impact of petroleum profit tax on economic development of Nigeria. *British Journal of*

Comment [Ma122]: Not cited

Kneller, R, Bleaney, M.F., & Gemmell, N. (1999). Fiscal policy and growth: Evidence from OECD countries. *Journal of Public Economics*, 74, 171-190

Comment [Ma123]: Not cited

Koch, S.F, Schoeman, N.J., & Van -Tonder, J, J. (2005). Economic growth and the structure of taxes in SouthAfrica: 1960-2002. *South African Journal of Economics*, 73 (2), 190-210

Comment [Ma124]: Not cited

Lee, Y & Gordon R (2005). Tax structure and economic growth“*Journal of public economics* 89(5-6) 1027-1043

Comment [Ma125]: Not cited

Musanga, B. (2007). Effects of taxation on economic growth (Uganda's experience: 1987-2005) Unpublished qualitative economics thesis. University of Makerere

Comment [Ma126]: Not cited